# RESEARCH ARTICLE 

# Explicit Asymptotic Limits for a Class of Discrete Volterra Equations 

István Győri ${ }^{\mathrm{a}}$ and David W. Reynolds ${ }^{\text {b }}{ }^{*}$<br>${ }^{\text {a }}$ Department of Mathematics, University of Pannonia, H-8200 Veszprém, Egyetem u. 10, Hungary.; ${ }^{\text {b }}$ School of Mathematical Sciences, Dublin City University, Dublin 9, Ireland.

(25th April 2011)

This paper presents explicit asymptotic limits for some solutions of a special kind of Volterra difference equations, and exhibits a class of equations having asymptotic equilibrium.

Keywords: Volterra difference equation, asymptotic equilibrium, asymptotically periodic, admissibility

AMS Subject Classification: 39A06, 39A22, 39A23

## 1. Introduction

This paper considers the asymptotic limits of solutions of

$$
\begin{equation*}
z(n+1 ; \xi)=g(n)+\xi+\sum_{j=0}^{n} H(n, j) z(j ; \xi), \quad n \in \mathbb{Z}^{+} ; \quad z(0 ; \xi)=\xi \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $g$ is a fixed function for which $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} g(n)$ exists. The solution of (1) can be expressed as $z(n ; \xi)=w(n)+y(n ; \xi)$ where $w$ solves $w(n+1)=g(n)+$ $\sum_{j=0}^{n} H(n, j) w(j)$ for $n \in \mathbb{Z}^{+}$and $w(0)=0$. It is assumed that $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} w(n)$ exists (sufficient conditions on $H$ which would ensure this can be found for example in [4, 6, 7 ] ). Then investigation of $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} z(n ; \xi)$ reduces to studying the asymptotic limit of $y(\cdot ; \xi)$, the solution of the homogeneous problem

$$
\begin{equation*}
y(n+1 ; \xi)=\xi+\sum_{j=0}^{n} H(n, j) y(j ; \xi), \quad n \in \mathbb{Z}^{+} ; \quad y(0 ; \xi)=\xi \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Equation (2) is said to have asymptotic equilibrium if $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} y(n ; \xi)$ exists for every vector $\xi$, and $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} y(n ; \xi) \neq 0$ whenever $\xi \neq 0$. Clearly the equation has asymptotic equilibrium if and only if $M:=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} Y(n)$ exists and $M$ is invertible, where $Y(n+1)=I+\sum_{j=0}^{n} H(n, j) Y(j)$ for $n \in \mathbb{Z}^{+}$and $Y(0)=I$.

In this note, an explicit formula for $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} y(n ; \xi)$ is derived if the kernel has the form $H(n, j)=\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} h_{k}(n, j) Q^{k}$, and the initial condition satisfies $Q^{p} \xi \neq 0$ but

[^0]$Q^{p+1} \xi=0$. In particular if $Q$ is nilpotent, the limiting matrix $M$ can be explicitly determined and shown to be invertible, so that (2) has asymptotic equilibrium.

One motivation for this work was to explore the connection between the approaches used in [1, 2] and [5], for studying asymptotically periodic solutions of discrete Volterra equations.

## 2. Main Result

Let $\mathbb{Z}^{+}=\{0,1,2, \ldots\}$ denote the set of non-negative integers, and $\mathbb{K}$ either $\mathbb{R}$ or $\mathbb{C}$. If $a=\left(a_{i}\right)$ is a vector in $\mathbb{K}^{d},\|a\|=\sqrt{\sum_{i=0}^{d}\left|a_{i}\right|^{2}} . \mathbb{K}^{d \times d}$ is the space of all $d \times d$ matrices with entries in $\mathbb{K}$, and the zero and identity matrices are denoted by 0 and $I$ respectively. If $A=\left(A_{i j}\right) \in \mathbb{K}^{d \times d},\|A\|=\sqrt{\sum_{i=0}^{d} \sum_{j=0}^{d}\left|A_{i j}\right|^{2}}$.

Also $\ell^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{Z}^{+} ; \mathbb{K}^{d}\right)$ denotes the set of all bounded $f: \mathbb{Z}^{+} \rightarrow \mathbb{K}^{d}$, and $\ell_{c}^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{Z}^{+} ; \mathbb{K}^{d}\right)$ the set of all $f \in \ell^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{Z}^{+} ; \mathbb{K}^{d}\right)$ for which $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} f(n)=: f(\infty)$ exists. We employ some terminology for Volterra kernels which is similar to that used in [3, Ch. 9].

Definition 2.1. A mapping $H: \mathbb{Z}^{+} \times \mathbb{Z}^{+} \rightarrow \mathbb{K}^{d \times d}$ is a Volterra kernel $H$ if $H(n, j)=0$ for all $j>n \geq 0 . H$ is called a Volterra kernel of type $\ell_{c}^{\infty}$ if in addition
(i) $\sup _{n \geq 0} \sum_{j=0}^{n}\|H(n, j)\|$ is finite;
(ii) $L_{H}:=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=0}^{n} H(n, j)$ exists;
(iii) $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} H(n, j)=H_{\infty}(j)$ exists for all $j \in \mathbb{Z}^{+}$.

It is convenient to use the notation $(H \star f)(n):=\sum_{j=0}^{n} H(n, j) f(j)$ for $n \geq 0$. It is shown in [7, Thm 3.7] that if $H$ is of type $\ell_{c}^{\infty}$ and $f \in \ell_{c}^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{Z}^{+} ; \mathbb{K}^{d}\right)$, then

$$
\begin{equation*}
\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty}(H \star f)(n)=L_{H} f(\infty)+\sum_{j=0}^{\infty} H_{\infty}(j)[f(j)-f(\infty)] \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

## ThEOREM 2.2. Suppose that

(a) $\xi \in \mathbb{K}^{d}, Q \in \mathbb{K}^{d \times d}, Q^{p} \xi \neq 0$ and $Q^{p+1} \xi=0$ for some integer $p \geq 1$,
(b) $\left\{h_{k}\right\}$ is a sequence of Volterra kernels $h_{k}: \mathbb{Z}^{+} \times \mathbb{Z}^{+} \rightarrow \mathbb{K}$,
(c) for each $(n, j) \in \mathbb{Z}^{+} \times \mathbb{Z}^{+}, H(n, j)=\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} h_{k}(n, j) Q^{k}$ converges absolutely,
(d) $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=0}^{n} h_{1}(n, j)$ exists,
(e) if $p \geq 2, h_{k}$ is of type $\ell_{c}^{\infty}$ for all $2 \leq k \leq p$.

Then the solution of (2) has the form $y(n ; \xi)=\xi+\sum_{i=1}^{p} \eta_{i}(n) Q^{i} \xi$ for all $n \geq 0$, where $\eta_{i}$ can be calculated recursively and $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \eta_{i}(n)=: \eta_{i}(\infty)$ exists, for each $i \in\{1, \ldots, p\}$.

Proof. It is convenient to set $h_{0}(n, j)=1$ if $j=0$, and $h_{0}(n, j)=0$ if $1 \leq j \leq n$. Substitution of this and (c) into (2) leads to $y(n+1 ; \xi)=$ $\sum_{j=0}^{n} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} h_{k}(n, j) Q^{k} y(j ; \xi)$ for all $n \geq 0$. It is easily shown by induction that the solution can be expressed in the required form: indeed if $y(j)=\sum_{s=0}^{p} \eta_{s}(j) Q^{s} \xi$ with $\eta_{0}(j)=1$ for all $0 \leq j \leq n$,

$$
y(n+1 ; \xi)=\sum_{j=0}^{n} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \sum_{s=0}^{p} h_{k}(n, j) \eta_{s}(j) Q^{k+s} \xi .
$$

Because of the absolute convergence of $\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} h_{k}(n, j) Q^{k}$,

$$
\sum_{s=0}^{p} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty}\left|h_{k}(n, j)\right|\left|\eta_{s}(j)\right|\left\|Q^{k+s} \xi\right\| \leq \sum_{s=0}^{p}\left(\sum_{k=0}^{\infty}\left|h_{k}(n, j)\right|\left\|Q^{k}\right\|\right)\left|\eta_{s}(j)\right|\left\|Q^{s} \xi\right\|
$$

is finite. Thus we can interchange the order of summation in

$$
\begin{aligned}
\sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \sum_{s=0}^{p} h_{k}(n, j) \eta_{s}(j) & Q^{k+s} \xi=\sum_{s=0}^{p} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} h_{k}(n, j) \eta_{s}(j) Q^{k+s} \xi \\
= & \sum_{s=0}^{p} \sum_{k=0}^{p-s} h_{k}(n, j) \eta_{s}(j) Q^{k+s} \xi=\sum_{s=0}^{p} \sum_{r=s}^{p} h_{r-s}(n, j) \eta_{s}(j) Q^{r} \xi
\end{aligned}
$$

Because the last summation is over a finite range, we see that

$$
y(n+1 ; \xi)=\sum_{r=0}^{p}\left(\sum_{s=0}^{r} \sum_{j=0}^{n} h_{r-s}(n, j) \eta_{s}(j)\right) Q^{r} \xi
$$

Since $\left\{\xi, Q \xi, \ldots, Q^{p} \xi\right\}$ is a linearly independent subset of $\mathbb{K}^{d}$, we deduce that $y(n+$ $1)=\sum_{r=0}^{p} \eta_{r}(n+1) Q^{r} \xi$, with $\eta_{r}(n+1)=\sum_{s=0}^{r} \sum_{j=0}^{n} h_{r-s}(n, j) \eta_{s}(j)$. Thus $\eta_{0}(n+$ 1) $=\sum_{j=0}^{n} h_{0}(n, j) \eta_{0}(j)=1$, as it should be. For $r \geq 1$, we obtain

$$
\eta_{r}(n+1)=h_{0}(n, 0) \eta_{r}(0)+\sum_{s=0}^{r-1} \sum_{j=0}^{n} h_{r-s}(n, j) \eta_{s}(j)
$$

so that $\eta_{1}(n+1)=1+\sum_{j=0}^{n} h_{1}(n, j)$ and

$$
\eta_{r}(n+1)=1+\sum_{j=0}^{n} h_{r}(n, j)+\sum_{s=1}^{r-1}\left(h_{r-s} \star \eta_{s}\right)(n), \quad r \geq 2
$$

Thus once the limits $\eta_{1}(\infty), \ldots, \eta_{r-1}(\infty)$ have been determined, we can deduce an expression for $\eta_{r}(\infty)$ using (3).
Corollary 2.3. Suppose that hypotheses (b), (c), (d), and (e) in Theorem 2.2 are true, and
( $\left.a^{\prime}\right) \xi \in \mathbb{K}^{d}, Q \in \mathbb{K}^{d \times d}, Q^{p} \neq 0$ and $Q^{p+1}=0$ for some integer $p \geq 1$.
Then the solution of (2) has the form $y(n ; \xi)=\xi+\sum_{i=1}^{p} \eta_{i}(n) Q^{i} \xi$ for all $n \geq 0$, where $\eta_{i}$ can be calculated recursively and $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \eta_{i}(n)=: \eta_{i}(\infty)$ exists, for each $i \in\{1, \ldots, p\}$. Also $M$ defined by $M \xi:=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} y(n ; \xi)$, exists, is invertible and given by $M=I+\sum_{i=1}^{p} \eta_{i}(\infty) Q^{i}$.
Corollary 2.4. Suppose that hypotheses (b), (c), and (d) in Theorem 2.2 are true, and
( $\left.a^{\prime \prime}\right) \xi \in \mathbb{K}^{d}, Q \in \mathbb{K}^{d \times d}, Q \neq 0$ and $Q^{2}=0$ for some integer $p \geq 1$.
Then the solution of (2) has the form $y(n ; \xi)=\xi+\sum_{j=0}^{n-1} h(n-1, j) Q \xi$ for all $n \geq 0, \lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} y(n ; \xi)=M \xi$, where $M:=I+\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j) Q$ is invertible.

## 3. Examples

In this section we examine some examples of the form

$$
\begin{equation*}
z(n+1 ; \xi)=\xi+\beta(n) e+\sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j) Q z(j ; \xi), \quad n \in \mathbb{Z}^{+} ; \quad z(0 ; \xi)=\xi \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

It is supposed that $Q e=0$, in which case the solution has the form $z(n ; \xi)=$ $\beta(n) e+y(n ; \xi)$ for $n \geq 1$, where $y(\cdot ; \xi)$ is the solution of the equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
y(n+1 ; \xi)=\xi+\sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j) Q y(j ; \xi), \quad n \in \mathbb{Z}^{+} ; \quad y(0 ; \xi)=\xi \tag{5}
\end{equation*}
$$

which is a special case of (2). We also assume that $\beta$ is in $\ell_{c}^{\infty}\left(\mathbb{Z}^{+} ; \mathbb{K}\right)$, and that $h$ is a Volterra kernel for which $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j)$ exists.

The particular examples in this section have been constructed by applying [5, Lemma 3] to examples of discrete Volterra equations discussed in [1, 2].

### 3.1 Examples with $Q \neq 0$ and $Q^{2}=0$

Assume in addition that $Q \neq 0, Q^{2}=0$. Then Corollary 2.4 provides the exact solution $z(n ; \xi)=\beta(n) e+\xi+\sum_{j=0}^{n-1} h(n-1, j) Q \xi$ for $n \geq 1$ and the asymptotic $\operatorname{limit} \lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} z(n ; \xi)=\beta(\infty) e+M \xi$, where $M=I+\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j) Q$ is invertible.

After transforming the example in [1], one obtains (4) with

$$
\begin{gather*}
h(n, j)=\frac{1}{7} \frac{(-1)^{j-1}}{2^{j-1}}\left\{1-\left(\frac{-1}{6}\right)^{n-j+1}\right\}, \quad \beta(n)=-\frac{3}{7}\left[1-\left(\frac{-1}{6}\right)^{n}\right]  \tag{6}\\
Q=\left(\begin{array}{cc}
1 & 1 \\
-1 & -1
\end{array}\right), \quad e=\binom{1}{-1} \tag{7}
\end{gather*}
$$

Here $\beta(\infty)=-3 / 7$ and $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j)=-4 / 21$, so that

$$
M=\frac{1}{21}\left(\begin{array}{cc}
17 & -4 \\
4 & 25
\end{array}\right)
$$

The particular solution considered in [1] corresponds to $\xi=(21)^{T}$ and $z(\infty ; \xi)=$ $M \xi-\frac{3}{7} e=(12)^{T}$.

A similar example can be derived from [2, Example 1]). Here $e$ and $Q$ remain as in (7), but

$$
h(n, j)=\frac{1}{14} \frac{(-1)^{j-1}}{2^{j-1}}\left\{1-\left(\frac{-1}{6}\right)^{n-j+1}\right\}, \quad \beta(n)=-\frac{3}{14}\left[1-\left(\frac{-1}{6}\right)^{n}\right]
$$

which are just half the expressions in (6). Clearly $\beta(\infty)=-3 / 14$ and $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j)=-2 / 21$. Hence

$$
M=\frac{1}{21}\left(\begin{array}{ll}
19 & -2 \\
21 & 23
\end{array}\right)
$$

The particular solution considered in [2, Example 1] corresponds to $\xi=(3 / 23 / 2)^{T}$ and $z(\infty ; \xi))=M \xi-\frac{3}{14} e=(12)^{T}$.
3.2 Example with $Q^{2}=Q^{3} \neq 0$

It is now assumed that $Q \neq 0$ and $Q^{2}=Q^{3} \neq 0$. Then Theorem 2.2 says that $z(n ; \xi) \rightarrow \beta(\infty) e+\xi+\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j) Q \xi$ as $n \rightarrow \infty$, provided $Q^{2} \xi=0$.

The transformation of [2, Example 3] yields the problem of $h$ and $\beta$ being as in (6), and

$$
Q=\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
1 & 1 & 0 \\
-1 & -1 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & 1
\end{array}\right), \quad e=\left(\begin{array}{c}
1 \\
-1 \\
1
\end{array}\right)
$$

so that $Q e=0$ and

$$
Q^{2}=Q^{3}=\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 \\
-1 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right)
$$

We note that $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} z(n ; \xi)=-3 / 7 e+M_{0} \xi$ provided $Q^{2} \xi=0$ (which is equivalent to $\xi_{1}=\xi_{3}$ ), with

$$
M_{0}=\frac{1}{21}\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
17 & -4 & 0 \\
4 & 25 & 0 \\
0 & -4 & 17
\end{array}\right)
$$

The particular solution considered in [2, Example 3] corresponds to $\xi=\left(\begin{array}{ll}2 & 12\end{array}\right)^{T}$ and $z(\infty ; \xi)=M_{0} \xi-\frac{3}{7} e=(121)^{T}$; also $Q^{2} \xi=0$.

What happens for initial values obeying $Q^{2} \xi \neq 0$ ? Since its minimal polynomial is cubic, $\left\{I, Q, Q^{2}\right\}$ is a linearly independent set in $\mathbb{R}^{3 \times 3}$. We follow the method used to prove Theorem 2.2, and look for a solution $Y(n)=\eta_{0}(n) I+\eta_{1}(n) Q+\eta_{2}(n) Q^{2}$ for $n \in \mathbb{Z}^{+}$of the matrix equation $Y(n+1)=I+\sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j) Q$ with $Y(0)=I$. By substituting the solution into this,

$$
Y(n+1)=I+\sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j) \eta_{0}(j) Q+\sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j)\left[\eta_{1}(j)+\eta_{2}(j)\right] Q^{2}
$$

and the initial conditions $\eta_{0}(0)=1, \eta_{1}(0)=0, \eta_{2}(0)=0$. Hence $\eta_{0}(n) \equiv 1$, $\eta_{1}(n+1)=\sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j)$ with $\eta_{1}(0)=0$, and

$$
\begin{equation*}
\eta_{2}(n+1)=\sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j) \eta_{1}(j)+\sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j) \eta_{2}(j), \quad \eta_{2}(0)=0 \tag{8}
\end{equation*}
$$

Though $\eta_{1}$ is explicitly known, this is not true of either $\eta_{2}$ or

$$
Y(n)=\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
1+\eta_{1}(n) & \eta_{1}(n) & 0 \\
-\eta_{1}(n) & 1-\eta_{1}(n) & 0 \\
-\eta_{2}(n) & \eta_{1}(n) & 1+\eta_{1}(n)+\eta_{2}(n)
\end{array}\right)
$$

It is easily checked that $h$ is of type $\ell_{c}^{\infty}$ and

$$
\limsup _{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=m}^{n}|h(n, j)| \leq \frac{7}{6} \limsup _{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{j=m+1}^{n+1} \frac{1}{2^{j}}=\frac{7}{6} \frac{\left(\frac{1}{2}\right)^{m+1}}{1-\frac{1}{2}} \xrightarrow{m \rightarrow \infty} 0 .
$$

Hence it can be concluded from [4, Thm 3.1] that $\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \eta_{2}(n)=: \eta_{2}(\infty)$ exists. Though we are not able to compute its value, we infer that $M=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} Y(n)$ exists with

$$
M=M_{0}+\eta_{2}(\infty) Q^{2}=\frac{1}{21}\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
17 & -4 & 0 \\
4 & 25 & 0 \\
-21 \eta_{2}(\infty) & -4 & 21 \eta_{2}(\infty)+17
\end{array}\right) .
$$

from which we deduce that $\operatorname{det} M=\frac{17}{21}+\eta_{2}(\infty)$. Hence $M$ would be invertible if $\eta_{2}(\infty) \neq-\frac{17}{21}$.

In order to ascertain whether $M$ is invertible or not, it may be easier to consider $p(n)=1+\eta_{1}(n)+\eta_{2}(n)$ for $n \geq 0: p$ indeed satisfies the initial-value problem $p(n+1)=1+\sum_{j=0}^{n} h(n, j) p(j)$ and $p(0)=1$. Again [4. Thm 3.1] implies that $p(\infty):=\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} p(n)$ exists. $M$ is invertible if and only if $p(\infty) \neq 0$.

## 4. Conclusions

Motivated by the study of asymptotic periodic solutions, this note attempts to investigate systematically a special class of discrete Volterra equations which have asymptotic equilibrium. To our knowledge, there is no such systematic investigation for a wider class of discrete Volterra equations. It seems to be a challenging project to study the asymptotic equlibria of a general discrete Volterra system and to utilize those results to analyse the existence of asymptotic periodic solutions.

## Acknowledgements

We are grateful to the referees for comments which improved the paper. István Győri was partially supported by the Hungarian National Foundation for Scientific Research (grant no. K73274), and DCU's International Visitors Programme.

## References

[1] J. Diblík, E. Schmeidel, and M.Růžičková, Existence of asymptotically periodic solutions of system of Volterra difference equations, J. Difference Equ. Appl. 15 (2009), pp. 1165-1177.
2] - , Asymptotically periodic solutions of Volterra system of difference equations, Comput. Math. Appl. 59 (2010), pp. 2854-2867.
[3] G. Gripenberg, S.O. Londen, and O. Staffans, Volterra Integral and Functional Equations, Encyclopedia of Mathematics and its Applications Vol. 34, Cambridge University Press, 1990.
[4] I. Győri and L. Horváth, Asymptotic representation of the solutions of linear Volterra difference equations, Adv. Difference Equ. (2008), pp. Art. ID 932831, 22. Available at http://www.hindawi. com/journals/ade/2008/932831.html
[5] I. Győri and D.W. Reynolds, On asymptotically periodic solutions of linear discrete Volterra equations, Fasc. Math. 44 (2010), pp. 53-67, Available at http://www.math.put.poznan.pl/fascicul.htm\#n44
[6] J. Morchało, Asymptotic properties of solutions of discrete Volterra equation, Math. Slovaca, 52 (2002), pp. 47-56.
[7] Y. Song and C.T.H. Baker, Admissibility for discrete Volterra equations, J. Difference Equ. Appl. 12 (2006), pp. 433-457.


[^0]:    *Corresponding author. Email: david.reynolds@dcu.ie

